

THE QUALITIES OF ENGLISH TEXTBOOKS FOR THE TENTH GRADE STUDENTS

Diyah Trinovita

STMIK Kalirejo, Indonesia

Email: diyahtrinovita95@gmail.com

Abstract

The objective of this research is to describe the qualities of the three English textbooks. This research was conducted using content analysis. The object of this research were three English textbooks, they are *Bahasa Inggris, Pathway to English*, and *Talk Active* for the tenth grade of senior high school. This research adapted from the combination criteria between Cunningsworth and criteria of good textbook from the government (BSNP). The data were obtained through interview, and document analysis. The data were analyzed through four steps - collection, reduction, display, and conclusion. The results show that BI book fulfilled six of seven criteria of good textbook and was categorized as suitable. PE book fulfilled two of seven criteria of good textbook and was categorized as partly suitable. TA book fulfilled three of seven criteria of good textbook and was categorized as partly suitable. *Bahasa Inggris* written by *Utami Widiati, Zuliati Rohmah*, dan *Faridah* is suitable to be used by the teacher and tenth grade students of Senior High School because this book almost fulfilled all criteria of a good textbook based on the combination criteria between Cunningsworth and BSNP.

Keywords: Evaluation; English Textbooks; Combination Criteria between Cunningsworth and BSNP

Introduction

Teaching and learning English as a foreign language has challenges for teachers and the students, because they do not use English in daily conversation. The students prefer to use the local language together with the low variety of Bahasa Indonesia than English (Yulia, 2014). It means that they are less to practice speaking English. Consequently, they get difficulties when they learn English. To deal with this, the teachers have responsibilities to prepare the learning materials, learning models or learning strategies, learning tools, and innovative learning methods to create the teaching-learning process are pleasant for the students (Rumahlatu, Huliselan, & Takaria, 2016).

To support the learning process, the textbooks also have an important part in the learning field because it becomes a learning tool that is commonly used to facilitate the students to follow the learning process which is contains the learning materials. It is supported by Brown (Brown, 1994) who notes “the presence of a textbook is necessary to support the teaching-learning process”. It means that a textbook can help the

teaching-learning process successful because the textbook is a media that can be used as guidance.

According to O'Neill (O'Neill, 1982), as cited in (Fakhomah & Srijono, 2017), there are some reasons in using textbooks as learning material. First, the textbook is designed under the students' needs. Second, the textbook provides the materials that can be used by the students in the present and future. Third, through a reasonable price, the students got materials to increase their knowledge. Besides, textbooks are easy to find because they are commercially provided in the book store. However, every textbook has a different design, even more, there is a quite different material between one book into another. As the teachers, they must know the quality of good books. It means that a good book is a book that is in accordance with the curriculum (Rahma, Haryanti, & Fatimah, 2013). Then, the textbooks must be compatible with the latest curriculum, the syllabus, and of course, they must be compatible with the aims and goals of teaching.

According to Cunningsworth (Cunningsworth, 1995), who said "the effectiveness of a textbook in arranging aims and goals, and preparing teaching materials to become a good consideration before deciding to use the textbook in the classroom". In other words, teachers should be careful when selected a textbook to apply it in the teaching-learning process. Besides, the teacher should recheck the textbook to know the appropriateness of the textbook itself before being applied in the classroom. Nevertheless, the teachers might not recheck the qualities of textbooks before they used it in the classroom. They only ensure that the book is based on the 2013 curriculum.

Textbook

Textbook is one of instructional materials as subject matter in a specific educational context used in the learning process. It is supported by Cunningsworth (Cunningsworth, 1995) who states that textbooks provide an educational text which can be used as a source of material for teaching and learning. Besides, Richard (Richards, 2017) states the textbook also provides learning objectives for the teaching process. It means that the teacher can use textbook as a reference to lead the learning process. In line with Cunningsworth and Richard opinion previously, the presence of the textbook gives an important role in classroom practice because the textbook can be as sources of material so that the teacher can utilize it to teach the students. Besides, textbook also contains exercises that can be used for students to examine their understanding. Furthermore, textbook also provides learning objectives for the teacher so that she/he can follow the rule of teaching based on the textbook.

Argues that there are some roles of textbook in language teaching, they are as a syllabus that reflect for learning objectives; sources of activities, practice, and communicative interaction for students; source of a primary guide in the classroom activities; resource of materials, spoken and written; a support media for less experienced teachers who have yet to gain confidence (Cunningsworth, 1995). Also propose some roles in using the textbook, they are textbook can save time, textbook gives direction to lessons, textbook guides the discussion, and textbook facilitated giving of homework (Tambunan, 2019).

Criteria of a Good Textbook

There are so many kinds of textbooks that can be used by the teacher to teach the students. However, the teacher should be careful to select an appropriate textbook for the students. The teacher should consider some of the reasons before she/he selects the textbook, they are the students' needs and characteristics, such as the age of the students, level of the students and also the learning style of the students (Handayani, 2016). Cunningsworth (Richards, 2017) proposes criteria of a good textbook, they are: a good textbook should be suitable with learners' need, a good textbook should propose the language used in the present or future, a good textbook should facilitate the learning process, and a good textbook should have clear directions to support the learning process. It can be summarized that a good textbook should correspond with the learners' needs. It means the material on the textbook should facilitate the learners to improve their proficiency in English, for instance, through the various genres of texts, it can help the learners to use English in their lives. Besides, a good textbook should have clear direction and instruction. In other words, clear instruction or explanation can help the teacher to teach well and the students can understand the material easily.

Furthermore, BSNP (*Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan*) also proposes criteria good textbook, they are a textbook should develop the students' ability to use English in spoken and written for the purpose of expanding students' intellectual, social and emotional aspects; a textbook should facilitate using proper English which correspond with language methods and to master communication skills; a textbook should develop the students' ability to communicate in English in their daily environment; a textbook should give directions to developing life skills such as personal, social, academic and vocational; a textbook should develop a cross-cultural understanding to build friendship within a local, national and international level; a textbook should orient to development of knowledge and technology. It can be said that a good textbook should build the students' insight in comprehend English whether it is about culture or habits (Pendidikan, 2018). A good textbook also assists students in developing their life skills to give experiences for their future. A good textbook also provides various kinds of activities to improve students' ability to use English in spoken and written form. And then, the learning materials in the textbook should follow the development of times, for instance, the topic should up-to-date.

Textbook Evaluation Criteria

To know the quality of textbook, the evaluation is needed because of good textbooks assist the teaching and learning effectively. Some aspects that must be evaluated include content/explanations, examples, tasks/exercises, and presentation/format. There are various types of textbook evaluation criteria. However, the researcher selected to use textbook evaluation criteria developed by the government (BSNP) and Cunningsworth (Cunningsworth, 1995).

Suggests four criteria of a good textbook such as (1) a good textbook should be appropriate with learners' needs; (2) a good textbook should propose language used in the present of future; (3) a good textbook should facilitate the learning process; and (4)

a good textbook should have clear directions to support the learning process. Besides, BSNP also proposes criteria of a good textbook, namely (1) a textbook should develop the students' ability to use English in spoken and written for the purpose of expanding students' intellectual, social and emotional aspects; (2) a textbook must use proper English according to language methods; (3) a textbook should develop the students' ability to communicate in English in their daily environment; (4) a textbook should give directions in developing life skills such as personal, social, academic and vocational; (5) a textbook should develop a cross-cultural understanding to build friendship within a local, national and international level; (6) a textbook should orient to development of knowledge and technology (Cunningsworth, 1995).

In this research, the researcher combined both criteria into one to evaluate the textbooks. The reason to choose BSNP criteria is that these criteria are officially guided assessment of English textbook evaluation in Indonesia that is used by the government. Furthermore, the researcher selected textbook evaluation criteria proposed by Cunningsworth (Cunningsworth, 1995) to combine it with BSNP because Cunningsworth (Pendidikan, 2018) theory provides textbook evaluation criteria in detail such as (1) aims and approaches are used to evaluate the conformity between the learning materials in the textbook and the learning objectives of curriculum. It implies that the learning activities in the book should be corresponding with KD of the curriculum; (2) design and organization seeks how the structure of learning materials is organized. Besides, this criterion is also used to find out how the complexity of learning materials whether it is suitable for learners' levels; (3) language contents are used to assess the presence of the discussion of grammar items, vocabulary builders, and pronunciation practices; (4) language skills are employed to evaluate listening, speaking, reading, and writing skills; (5) topics are utilized to seek how the variations and the up-to-date topics that are provided in the textbook; (6) methodology is employed to appraise the language approach that is applied by the textbook, whether it is in accordance with the demand of the curriculum; (7) teacher's book is used to assess how the assistance the book for teachers, whether it provides teaching procedures for them; (8) practical consideration seek how the quality of textbook appearance, whether it is colorful, strong and long-lasting.

Furthermore, there are two main components of the textbook evaluation criteria by BSNP. (1) The advisability of content consists of the suitability of learning material with basic competence of curriculum related to transactional, interpersonal, and functional texts; the accurateness of materials including the social functions, generic structures and linguistic features of the texts; the supplementary of materials covering the topics of learning materials must be up-to-date, improve students' life skills, and support the unity of diversity. (2) The advisability of presentation consists of the technique of presentation must be presented in systematic and balance among units; the learning presentations focus on students' learning-centered, scientific approach, and develop the ability to self-evaluation; the completeness of presentations involve opening

parts - preface, and table of content, content parts – an introduction part, summary of learning material, and reflection, closing parts - a glossary, a reference, and an index.

Research Methods

To deal with various textbooks with kinds of publishers, the evaluation must be done because it aimed to determine whether the textbooks were appropriate with the curriculum and standard criteria a good textbook or not. The English textbooks that the researcher evaluated were *Bahasa Inggris* written by *Utami Widiyati, Zuliati Rohmah & Furaidah* developed by *Kemendikbud*, *Pathway to English* written by *Theresia Sudarwati & Eudia Grace* developed by *Erlangga*, *Talk Active* written by *Lanny Kurniawan & Kenneth W. Ament* developed by *Yudhistira* (Stern & Ahlgren, 2002). Those textbooks are used by the English teachers at state schools in Yogyakarta. The textbooks are chosen based on the conformity of the 2013 curriculum as the latest curriculum, and observation through an interview with English teachers at state schools in Yogyakarta, especially the teacher at the tenth-grade. Furthermore, the researcher decided to use BSNP (*Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan*) textbook evaluation criteria to evaluate three English textbooks that are compatible with the tenth-grade students in senior high school. Besides, the researcher also used the textbook evaluation criteria suggested by Cunningsworth (Cunningsworth, 1995). In this case, the researcher combined both criteria in order to create the criteria to be more completed.

Hasil dan Pembahasan

Table 1 displays the findings of the qualities of three English textbooks which were *Bahasa Inggris* (BI), *Pathway to English* (PE) and *Talk Active* (TA) based on the combination criteria of BSNP and Cunningsworth.

Table 1
The Qualities of Three English Textbooks Based on the Combination of Criteria between BSNP and Cunningsworth

NO	CRITERION	QUALITY		
		BI	PE	TA
1.	The relevance of learning materials to the curriculum	Suitable	Partly Suitable	Suitable
2.	The supporting learning materials	Suitable	Partly Suitable	Partly Suitable
3.	The role of language skills in the learning materials	Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
4.	The suitability of learning approach to the curriculum	Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
5.	The role of language contents in the learning materials	Suitable	Partly Suitable	Partly Suitable
6.	The completeness presentation of the textbook	Partly Suitable	Partly Suitable	Partly Suitable
7.	The role of teacher's book	Suitable	-	-

Table 1 shows the qualities of English textbooks based on the combination criteria between Cunningsworth (1995) and BSNP. In criterion 1, the relevance of learning materials to the curriculum, BI and TA books were categorized as suitable. It can be seen from the appropriateness between learning objectives in the textbook and *Kompetensi Dasar* of the 2013 curriculum. BI and TA books have succeeded in providing various types of texts, various activities, and exercises for students. Moreover, the learning materials in the BI and TA books were also presented in a simple to complex manner, so that the students could learn from the easiest level to the more difficult levels. Meanwhile, PE book was categorized as partly suitable because this book cannot provide the learning materials from a simple to complex, for example, the learning materials about genres of texts were not arranged in sequence. The learning material about past activity is discussed firstly, descriptive text is discussed secondly, recount text is discussed thirdly, and narrative text is discussed lastly. In this case, students will learn past tense first rather than present tense of descriptive text.

Criterion 2, the supporting learning materials of the BI book was categorized as suitable whereas PE and TA books were categorized as partly suitable. BI, PE, and TA books were succeeded in providing the learning materials to develop students' personal skills through self-reflection activity; social skills through activities that encourage students to do pair work or group work, being tolerant to others, being anti-violence, and respect for gender equality; academic skills through activities to improve students' ability to gain and use information, solve problem and make decisions to scientific work; support for cultural diversity by presenting the contents using Indonesian and western culture; and the topics in those textbooks were also presented variously. Nevertheless, only BI book provides the learning materials to develop students' vocational skills through activities related to doing a certain job or occupation. Furthermore, only BI and TA books provided up-to-date topics of learning materials.

Criterion 3, the role of language skills in BI, PE, and TA books were also categorized as suitable. Mostly, listening skills activities in those books were involving the teacher as a listening resource because those books do not equip with audio recording. That means, the teacher was asked to read the text and then the students were asked to listen to the teacher. Speaking skills in those books also provided various activities, for instance, role-play, retelling a story. Then, the learning material for reading skills successfully attracts students' interests through a variety of activities and topics of texts. Besides, the most of writing skills activities in BI, PE, and TA books were equipped with writing guidelines. In this case, it can help students to produce a text easily. Moreover, the integrated skills activities also can be found in those textbooks. The integrated skills include the activities between reading and writing skills; listening, speaking and writing skills; speaking and writing skills; and so forth.

The suitability of learning approach to the curriculum in criterion 4 showed that BI, PE, and TA books were categorized as suitable. The results of analysis showed that those textbooks had succeeded in providing the learning approach using a scientific approach-observing, questioning, exploring, associating, and communicating.

The criterion of the role of language contents in the learning materials showed that BI book was categorized as suitable. Meanwhile, PE and TA books were categorized as partly suitable. Grammar discussions in BI, PE, and TA books were well presented. Moreover, grammar discussions in those books were provided in all chapters, although BI book was identified as lacking in providing grammar discussion in chapter two. Furthermore, vocabulary discussions in BI book were also provided in each chapter. Vocabulary builders in BI book contain lists of words in accordance with the topic of learning materials. Unfortunately, PE book did not provide a specific discussion of vocabulary builders. Meanwhile, although TA book did also not provide a specific discussion about vocabulary, however a discussion of pronunciation practice in TA book can be used to enrich students' vocabulary. BI and TA book had succeeded in providing pronunciation practice which is followed by the phonetic symbol. Unfortunately, PE book failed to provide pronunciation practice for students.

The criterion of the completeness presentation of the textbook showed that BI, PE, and TA books were categorized as partly suitable. This is due to the fact that those textbooks cannot fulfill all sub-criteria of the completeness presentation of the textbook. BI, PE, and TA books had succeeded in providing preface, table of content, introduction section, self-reflection, and reference. Moreover, those textbooks did also not provide CD or audio recording. Furthermore, the summary of learning materials was only provided in TA book, whereas glossary was only provided in BI and TA books. Besides, PE and TA books were identified as fail to provide an index and those textbooks were also less attractive.

Criterion 7, the role of the teacher's book, BI book was categorized as suitable because this book provides a particular book for the teachers. Unfortunately, PE and TA books did not provide any particular book for the teachers.

Conclusion

Generally, Bahasa Inggris (BI) book fulfilled six of seven criteria of a good textbook. BI book was categorized as suitable to be used in the teaching and learning process. This was due to the fact that BI book met almost all criteria based on the combination of theories between BSNP and Cunningsworth. Furthermore, Pathway to English (PE) book only fulfilled two of seven criteria of good textbook. However, PE book can still be categorized as partly suitable. Meanwhile, Talk Active (TA) book fulfilled three of the seven criteria of a good textbook. TA books can also be categorized as partly suitable to be used in the teaching and learning process.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Brown, Douglas. (1994). *Principles Of Language Learning And Teaching* Prentice Hall Englewoods Cliffs. *New Jersey*.
- Cunningsworth, Alan. (1995). *Choosing Your Coursebook*. Macmillan.
- Fakhomah, Desy Nur, & Srijono, Djoko. (2017). *An Analysis On English Textbook Entitled Bahasa Inggris Based On Tomlinson's Theory*. Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta.
- Handayani, Sri. (2016). The Evaluation Of English Textbook For Grade VII Of Junior High School In Indonesia. *Proceedings Of ISELT FBS Universitas Negeri Padang*, 4(2), 328–339.
- O'Neill, Robert. (1982). Why Use Textbooks? *ELT Journal*, 36(2), 104–111.
- Pendidikan, Badan Standar Nasional. (2018). *Instrumen Penilaian Buku Teks Pelajaran Bahasa Inggris*.
- Rahma, Fahmawati Isnita, Haryanti, Dwi, & Fatimah, Siti. (2013). *An Analysis Of The English Textbook For Junior High School VII Based On Content Standard Of BSNP*. Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta.
- Richards, Jack C. (2017). *Curriculum Development In Language Teaching*. Cambridge University Press Cambridge, UK.
- Rumahlatu, Dominggus, Huliselan, Estevanus K., & Takaria, Johanis. (2016). An Analysis Of The Readiness And Implementation Of 2013 Curriculum In The West Part Of Seram District, Maluku Province, Indonesia. *International Journal Of Environmental And Science Education*, 11(12), 5662–5675.
- Stern, Luli, & Ahlgren, Andrew. (2002). Analysis Of Students' Assessments In Middle School Curriculum Materials: Aiming Precisely At Benchmarks And Standards. *Journal Of Research In Science Teaching*, 39(9), 889–910.
- Tambunan, Monica Septiani. (2019). *Content Analysis Of English Textbook "Interactive English" Used In First Grade Junior High School In 2013 Curriculum*.
- Yulia, Yuyun. (2014). An Evaluation Of English Language Teaching Programs In Indonesian Junior High Schools In The Yogyakarta Province. *RMIT University*.

Copyright holder:

Nama Author (Tahun Terbit)

First publication right:

Syntax Literate: Jurnal Ilmiah Indonesia

This article is licensed under:

